

The Comparative Study of Various Translations of Manto's Short-story: "Toba Tek Singh"

Muhammad Usman Khan

Researcher at UNESP-Sao Jose do Rio Preto, Brazil
Department of Letters

Abstract

Saadat Hassan Manto is a reknown short-story writer of Indian subcontinent. His popularity is spread across the borders of India and Pakistan. His short-stories are translated by various scholars from Urdu into global languages including English. One of his short-story "Toba Tek Singh" is considered as a masterpiece of his work, translated many times into English by different writers. The story tells us about the sufferings at the times when All India was divided into two parts and people were exchanged. Muslims immigrated to a new-created country 'Pakistan' and, on the other hand, Hindus and Sikhs went to India. Later on, it was decided to exchange the lunatics of the both countries. In one assylum of Pakistan, the lunatics were confused about the partition and they were not ready to be handed over to another country. The central character of the short-stroy is a Sikh whose real name is Bishan Singh but is called as Toba Tek Singh, the name of the village he belongs to. At the time of transfer from Pakistan to India, he denied and died on the no-man land, the midline between Pakistan and India. The short story criticises the politicians and narrates the massacres of partition. In present scenorio, the researcher focused on different four translations of Manto's short-story "Toba Tek Singh" and analysed comparatively the selected words and passages in accordance with the criterion set by Larson's meaning-based translation theory. It was found that no any translator did a thorough job and every translation had some pros and cons. Some real words of the source language were omitted and on the contrary, some new words were added into the translation. Finally, among the four writers, the 'Anonymous translator' was regarded as the best translator.

Keywords: Manto, Toba Tek Singh, Meaning-based Theory, Translation, equivalency,

Introduction

Saadat Hassan Manto was born in May 1912 in British India and after the partition, he came to Pakistan and died in January 1955 at the age of 42. He is considered a giant short-storywriter of Urdu in Indian subcontinent. Manto worked as a film and radio scriptwriter and a journalist. He wrote twenty-two collections of short stories, one novel, five collections of radio plays, three collections of essays, and two collections of personal sketches. According to Gatt (2013), Manto a born rebel never pay attention to the norms of the society; he chose his own path to tread on at times accused of being a communal by his detractors but he took it upon himself to show the interiors of those sitting at the margins in the social hierarchy—menial workers, whores, wagers, pimps, brutes and alcoholics who always remain unsung in a hollowed society where all had similar contribution in the dance of nakedness (p. 60). Manto was arguably the best Urdu short story writer and the owner of realistic prose in South Asia. He was also a maverick in a society prickly about obscenity in literature, an issue that an ideological Pakistan is still struggling with (Ahmad, 2013). Manto wrote about the massacres and sufferings of partition when in 1947, all India was divided into two parts and a new country, Pakistan came into being. While exchanging the people of both sides, a storm of robbery, rapes, killing, kidnaping and hatred burst out among the immigrants that affected millions of newcomers to India and Pakistan. Manto was one of them. In the months that preceded Partition, Hindus and Sikhs on one side and Muslims on the other glared into each other's hate-filled

eyes before embarking on frenzied blood-baths. The character and scale of the butchery was unprecedented in Indian history (Ali, 2012, para. 5). So, the similarity between some of the writings of Orkeny and Manto's is striking. The closeness between their stories provoked the query, as to how narrative energy deals with an extreme situation, like the catastrophe of the Holocaust and the Partition of India (Koves, 1997, p. 2147).

One of his short-stories, 'Toba Tek Singh' is considered a masterpiece, set in the mental hospital in the city of Lahore at the time of Partition. When whole cities were being ethnically cleansed, how could the asylums escape? In this short-story, the Hindu and Sikh lunatics are told by officers authorizing the transfer of power that they will be forcibly transferred to institutions in India. The inmates rebel. They embrace each other and weep. They will not be parted willingly. They have to be forced on to the trucks. One of them, a Sikh, is so overcome by rage that he dies on the demarcation line which divides Pakistan from India. Confronted by so much insanity in the real world, Manto discovered normality in the asylum. The 'lunatics' have a better understanding of the crime that is being perpetrated than the politicians who have agreed to Partition (Ali, 2012, para. 14). The central character in Manto's fiction is a Sikh who has been confined in the lunatic asylum for fifteen years. His actual name is Bishan Singh, but he is known as Toba Tek Singh, the name of the village he comes from (Bose, p. 152). Manto, the writer of masterpiece 'Toba Tek Singh' in his short stories describes how the humanity, the peace loving, god-fearing people suffer most on account of the communal hatred spread all across the

world and depicts the scenes of untold miseries faced by the helpless people where the communal bigots and fanatics have become law unto themselves, perpetuating the mayhem of slaughtering people on the basis of communal identity, irrespective of sex or age. The controversial writer despite being accused of obscenity, debauchery and drinking was very insightful at heart and he felt the pangs of separation amidst the prevailing atmosphere of mistrust and hypocrisy (Gatt, 2013, p. 61).

‘Toba Tek Singh’ has become a symbol of the confused and torn identities arising from separation from one’s ancestral home. He wins over those who “claim to be sane” and who want to fix his identity, as his death takes place in no-man’s-land, where the writ of neither nation prevails (Tiwari, 2013, p. 55). According to Jalal, ‘Toba Tek Singh’ was, is and will continue to remain one of the most revered famous short stories written by the celebrated Urdu writer Saadat Hasan Manto (p. 265). This short-story is written in Urdu and translated into many languages including English. The objective of this research is to compare various English translations of ‘Toba Tek Singh’ rendered by four different writers.

1. Translation by Tahira Naqvi
2. Translation by Sardar Khushwant Singh
3. Translation by Frances W. Pritchett
4. Translation by Anonymous

Rationale for the Selection of ‘Toba Tek Singh’ Translations

The four genres of translation of the short-story ‘Toba Tek Singh’ were selected to check their pros and cons comparatively because there is a clear difference of culture and location between

the source language (Urdu) and target language (English). It is to know about translation which actually carries the value of meaning-based translation.

Theoretical Framework

This research is based on the Mildred Larson’s meaning-based translation theory. For Larson (1984), translation consists of transferring without distortion the meaning of the source language into the target language, meaning which must be kept constant, even when the form of the source language changes as it is turned into the form of the target language. The form here represents the grammatical surface structure of the language, while meaning refers to the semantic deep structures. A translation based on the semantic structure of the language takes also into consideration the communication situation: historical setting, cultural setting, intention of the author, as well as the different kinds of meaning contained in the explicit and implicit information of the text. Besides referential and structural meaning, situational meaning is presented as an important element that would help the translator interpret the author’s culture or the cultural information given in the text. She makes the difference between literal and idiomatic translation, stating that a good translator should try to translate idiomatically, that is his translation will not sound like a translation, it shall sound natural in the target language, taking care not to fall into “unduly free translations”. The text to be translated has to make part of a translation project which involves the text, the target, the team and the tools, what Larson calls the four T’s. When that is settled various steps follow: the initial draft, evaluation of the initial draft, consultation and final draft. All these

steps involve analysis of the text, comparison with the source text, evaluation of the translation. A literal translation sounds like nonsense and has little communication value. A truly idiomatic translation does not sound like translation. It sounds like it was written originally in the receptor language (see also in Vanilla, 2010).

Problem of Statement

The short-story 'Toba Tek Singh' is translated from Urdu into English by four different writers. The researcher has to investigate about the translation that is considered the best one, using the measures of Larson's meaning-based translation theory.

Methodology

A comparative method was applied to analyze all the four texts of different translations on the criteria of meaning-based translation theory and extract pros and cons of them regarding literal and cultural aspects respectively. Crucial words and passages were selected from the four texts of translations and used as a unit of analysis.

Discussion

In the first paragraph of the short-story, Manto used the phrase 'ethical prisoners' that is translated by Tahira Naqvi as 'civil prisoners'. It is a meaning-based good translation as the word ethical prisoners has different meaning in English. For English readers, 'civil prisoners' is a meaningful word. Khushwant Singh translated 'ethical prisoners' as mere 'prisoners'. It is also suitable. Frances W. Pritchett translated the same phrase as 'criminal offenders' that is unsuitable. The

Anonymous translator replaced 'prisoners' with 'criminals' that is ultimately unsuitable. In this paragraph, Manto used the word 'the home of lunatics' that is translated by Tahira Naqvi as lunatic assylum and institution and [merely] assylum. Lunatic assylum is a proper word for the home of lunatics but institution and [merely] assylum have different meanings in English culture such as institution of agriculture, institution of engineering, assylum for immigrants and assylum for orphans etc. Pritchett translated it as 'insane assylums' that is also a beautiful expression. Khushwant Singh's translation is 'lunatic assylums' that is perfect. The Anonymous translator replaced it just as 'assylums' that is incomplete expression. The phrase 'handed over to India' is translated by Tahira Naqvi as 'allowed to go to India', that is not a meaning-based translation. The Anonymous translator the Urdu idiom 'handed over to India' as 'handed over to India'. Pritchett put the idiom in this place as 'send over' and 'confide to'. Khushwant Singh translated it as 'transfer to' and 'send to,' that is also a good translation. The sentence: 'Nonetheless, [with respect to the decision of intelligencia,] several high-level conferences took place' is translated by Tahira Naqvi as 'Nonetheless, several high-level conferences took place,' that is a not meaning-based translation because the phrase 'with respect to intelligencia' is not translated in English. Khushwant Singh translated this sentence as 'It took many conferences of important officials from the two sides to come to this decision.' This is also meaning-carrying translation. Pritchett translated it as 'according to the decision of the learned, high-level conferences took place here

and there, and finally a day was fixed for the exchange of lunatics." It is a literal translation but the worst translation as "according to the decision of the learned" has no meaning in English. The best translation is rendered by the Anonymous translator that is "However, the decision had been taken at the topmost level on both sides. After high-level conferences were held a day was fixed for exchange of the lunatics."

In Tahira Naqvi's translation of : "those [Muslim] inmates who had relatives in India were retained there"; a word "Muslim" is missed that creates ambiguity. In the Anonymous translation, "It was agreed that those Muslims who had families in India would be permitted to stay back while the rest would be escorted to the border." the whole sentence creates better impression but the phrase "it was agreed" is added by translator. Pritchett translated it as "Those Muslim lunatics whose relatives were all in Hindustan were allowed to remain there." it is also meaning-based translation. Khushwant Singh translated it as "Muslim lunatics whose families were still residing in India were to be left undisturbed." It is rhetorical translation. Manto's Urdu sentence: "what happened in that side is not known," is translated by Tahira Naqvi as "What happened in India is not known," is a good example of meaning-based translation. The same sentence is translated by Khushwant Singh as "While it is not known what the reaction in India was." it is also a meaning-based translation. Pritchett translated it as "No telling what was going on that side." It is not a sufficient sentence. The Anonymous translated it as "Nobody knew what transpired in India." It is based on rhetoric. "One man, who had been reading *Zamindar* regularly for nearly twelve years." It is a

misleading translation of a sentence rendered by Tahira Naqvi because here, "One Muslim lunatic" is translated as "One man". In the same way, "Zamindar" was an Urdu daily at that time and the word "daily" is not included into it. The Anonymous translator replaced it as "A Muslim lunatic, a regular reader of the fiery Urdu daily *Zamindar*." It is not a fair translation because "twelve years" are excluded. Pritchett translated it as "One Muslim lunatic, who every day for twelve years had regularly read the "Zamindar"." Here, again the word "daily" is not pasted before the *Zamindar* because English readers are not aware of it. Khushwant Singh translated it as "One Muslim lunatic, a regular reader of the fire-eating daily newspaper *Zamindar*." The phrase "fire-eating daily" is used for rhetorical expression. The duration of "twelve years" is not mentioned. The word "Moulie Sahib" (Mr. Clergy) is not translated by Khushwant Singh, Tahira and Anonymous translator in any way. Pritchett put it as "Molbi Sa'b". "During the course of a bath one morning, an [Muslim] inmate shouted, "Pakistan Zindabad!"". This a translation rendered by Tahira Naqvi but it is not a meaning-based translation as the inmate who shouted was a Muslim and "Pakistan Zindabad" is Urdu/Persian words which mean "long live Pakistan." Khushwant Singh used the same manner and translated it as; "One day a Muslim lunatic, while taking his bath, raised the slogan 'Pakistan Zindabad'." The Anonymous translator replaced the same manner: "One day while taking his bath, a Muslim lunatic yelled, "Pakistan Zindabad!""

Pritchett did a great job and translated the same sentence as "One day, while

bathing, a Muslim lunatic raised the cry of "Long live Pakistan!" The sentence of Manto: "They could not infer any result from their conversation" is translated by Tahira Naqvi as "little information could be gained by talking to them." it is not meaning-based translation. The Anonymous translator transformed it into: "... from whose conversation they could not glean anything." It is an ideal translation. Pritchett translated the same sentence as "nothing could be picked up from their conversation either." It is also similar to the first one. Khuswant Singh translated it as "Nor was there anything to be learnt by eardropping on their conversations." The latter three translations are similar. Muhammad Ali Jinnah and Quaid-e-azam are not explained by Khushwant Singh, Pritchett, Tahira Naqvi as leader of all India Muslim League for English readers. The Anonymous translator did not mention "Muhammad Ali Jinnah" in his/her translation. "For this very reason all the inmates who were altogether mad found themselves in a quandary; they could not figure out whether they were in Pakistan or India" It is a translation rendered by Tahira Naqvi, whereas Manto's intension is: "All those lunatics of the assylum whose minds were not broken down completely." There is a clear difference of meaning between two sentences. The Anonymous translator described it as "That was why they were all at a loss whether they were now in India or in Pakistan". It is also far from the original. Pritchett translated it as "This is the reason that in the insane asylum, all the lunatics whose minds were not completely gone were trapped in the dilemma of whether they were in Pakistan or Hindustan. It can be considered a meaning-based translation. Khushwant Singh translated the same passage as "

That was why both the mad and the partially mad were unable to decide whether they were now in India or in Pakistan." It is his own interpretation.

In fifth paragraph, the word "Hindustan" is translated by Tahira Naqvi, Pritchett as "Hindustan" that is unfamiliar word for English readers. It should be translated as "India" as done by Khushwant Singh and Anonymous translator. "A Muslim radio engineer, who had an M.Sc. degree, and never mixed with anyone, given as he was to taking long walks by himself all day, was so affected by the current debate that one day he took all his clothes off, gave the bundle to one of the attendants and ran into the garden stark naked." It is a good meaning-based translation rendered by Khushwant Singh. The same passage is translated by Tahira Naqvi as "One morning, a Muslim engineer who used to spend most of his time walking back and forth in a particular part of the garden suddenly took off his clothes and began running about naked." Tahira's translation has omitted the words "attendant", and "radio" and she also added the phrase "one morning" that is a great mistake. Pritchett translated it as "in an M.Sc.-qualified radio engineer, who was Muslim, who used to stroll all day in silence on a special path in the garden entirely apart from the other lunatics, the change that manifested itself was that he removed all his clothing, confided it to the care of a warden, and began to wander all around the garden entirely naked." In this translation the word "wardon" has extra meaning. The Anonymous translator converted the same sentence into his/her language as "all this hubbub affected a radio engineer with an MSc degree, a Muslim, a quiet man who took long walks by himself. One day he stripped off all his clothes, gave them to a

guard and ran in the garden stark naked.'' He added the phrase ''all this hubbub affected'' that explains the real situation and this translation has right to be awarded with the title ''meaning-based translation. He/she used ''guard'' instead of ''wardon''.

A [fat] Muslim lunatic from Chaniot, who used to be one of the most devoted workers of the All India Muslim League, and obsessed with bathing himself fifteen or sixteen times a day, had suddenly stopped doing that and announced his name was Mohamed Ali that he was Quaid-e-Azam Mohamed Ali Jinnah. This had led a Sikh inmate to declare himself Master Tara Singh, the leader of the Sikhs. Apprehending serious communal trouble, the authorities declared them dangerous, and shut them up in separate cells.'' It is a translation of Khushwant Sing that cannot be considered a beautiful meaning-based translation because it has missed a word ''fat''. On the other hand, Tahira translated the same passage as '' A fat Muslim from Chiniot, who had once been an active member of the Muslim League and who bathed at least fifteen times during the day, suddenly gave up bathing altogether. His name was Mohammed Ali. One day he announced that he was Quaid-e-Azam, Mohammed Ali Jinnah. Following his example, a Sikh in his enclosure announced that he was Master Tara Singh. Blood would have been spilled, but luckily both men were declared to be dangerous and were confined to separate quarters.'' Tahira did not add ''the leader of Sikh'' which was necessary for explanation. ''a stout Muslim lunatic from Chiniot who had been an enthusiastic worker for the Muslim League, and who bathed fifteen or sixteen times a day, suddenly abandoned this habit. His name was

Muhammad Ali. Accordingly, one day in his madness he announced that he was the Qa'id-e Azam Muhammad Ali Jinnah. In imitation of him, a Sikh lunatic became Master Tara Singh. In this madness it almost came to bloodshed, but both were declared 'dangerous lunatics' and shut up in separate rooms.'' This is a translation of Pritchett which has no explanations of Quaid-e-azam Muhammad Ali Jinnah and Master Tara Singh. ''Another Muslim inmate from Chiniot, an erstwhile adherent of the Muslim League who bathed fifteen or sixteen times a day, suddenly gave up bathing. As his name was Mohammed Ali, he one day proclaimed that he was none other than Quaid-e-Azam Mohammed Ali Jinnah. Taking a cue from him a Sikh announced that he was Master Tara Singh, the leader of the Sikhs. This could have led to open violence. But before any harm could be done the two lunatics were declared dangerous and locked up in separate cells.'' It is a translation of Anonymous which has explained for English readers that Master Tara Singh was a leader of Sikhs. It is, with all other requirements, the best translation. ''There was a young Hindu lawyer from Lahore who had gone off his head after an unhappy love affair. When told that Amritsar was to become a part of India, he went into a depression because his beloved lived in Amritsar, [some words of source language are omitted here] something he had not forgotten even in his madness. That day he abused every major and minor Hindu and Muslim leader who had cut India into two, turning his beloved into an Indian and him into a Pakistani. When news of the exchange reached the asylum, his friends offered him congratulations, because he was now to be sent to India, the country of his beloved'' [Khushwant Singh]. Here, ''friends offered him

congratulation`` is not meaning-based translation. In Tahira's translation: ``There was a lawyer in the asylum, a young man from Lahore who had lost his sanity over a tragic love affair. He was deeply grieved when he discovered that Amritsar had become part of India, because the girl he had been in love with was from there. She had rejected this young lawyer, but despite his mental state, he still cared for her. And he cursed all the leaders, both Muslim and Hindu, who were responsible for splitting Hindustan in two. His beloved had become a Hindustani while he was now a Pakistani. Some of the other inmates tried to comfort the lawyer. They told him he would be sent to Hindustan, where his beloved lived. But he did not wish to leave Lahore, for he felt that his practice would not thrive in Amritsar.`` The world ``Hindu`` is missed. In spite of it, Tahira's translation has some good qualities. ``There was a young Hindu lawyer from Lahore who had been rejected in love and had turned lunatic. When he heard that Amritsar had gone away into India, then he was very sad. He had fallen in love with a Hindu girl from that very city. Although she had rejected the lawyer, even in his madness he hadn't forgotten her. Thus he abused all those Hindu and Muslim leaders who had connived together and made Hindustan into two fragments-- his beloved had become Hindustani, and he Pakistani. When talk of the exchange began, then some of the lunatics comforted the lawyer, saying that he shouldn't mind about it, that he would be sent to Hindustan-- the Hindustan where his beloved lived. But he didn't want to leave Lahore, because he thought that in Amritsar his practice wouldn't flourish.`` This is a translation rendered by Pritchett and it is a word for word but he has used

``comforted`` and ``should not mind`` for the same meaning as twice. ``Among the inmates of the asylum was a Hindu lawyer from Lahore who had gone mad because of unrequited love. He was deeply pained when he learnt that Amritsar, where the girl lived, would form part of India. He roundly abused all the Hindu and Muslim leaders who had conspired to divide India into two, thus making his beloved an Indian and him a Pakistani. When the talks on the exchange were finalized his mad friends asked him to take heart since now he could go to India. But the young lawyer did not want to leave Lahore, for he feared for his legal practice in Amritsar.`` The last one is of Anonymous and it is the best one.

``When told that the British had decided to go home after granting independence to India, they went into a state of deep shock and were seen conferring with each other in whispers the entire afternoon. They were worried about their changed status after independence. Would there be a European ward or would it be abolished? Would breakfast continue to be served or would they have to subsist on bloody Indian chapati?`` [Khushwant Singh]. It is a good translation carrying entire meaning but a phrase ``the entire afternoon`` is added by him. ``In the European Ward were two Anglo-Indians. When they heard that the English had given Hindustan freedom and then left, they were devastated. In the course of several secret meetings, they discussed the future of their status in the asylum. Would the European Ward be retained? Would they continue to get breakfast? Would they be forced to eat the bloody Indian chapati instead of bread?`` [Tahira Naqvi]. In Tahira's translation, the phrase ``several secret meetings`` is unsuitable for lunatics. ``In the European ward there were two Anglo-

Indian lunatics. When they learned that the English had freed Hindustan and gone away, they were very much shocked. And for hours they privately conferred about the important question of what their status in the lunatic asylum would be now. Would the European Ward remain, or be abolished? Would breakfast be available, or not? Instead of proper bread, would they have to choke down those bloody Indian chapattis?" [Pritchett]. It is the best translation, word for word but explanatory. "There were two Anglo-Indians in the European ward. When informed the British were leaving, they spent hours together discussing the problems they would be faced with: Would the European ward be abolished? Would they get breakfast? Instead of bread, would they have to make do with measly Indian chapattis?" [Anonymous]. In this translation, some words are omitted.

"His feet and ankles were swollen from standing too much, but in spite of the bodily discomfort he experienced, he refused to rest. With great seriousness he listened to all the talk about the matter, then assumed a solemn air and replied, "Oper di gur gur di annexe di bay dhanian di mung daal di of di Pakistan government"—his usual gibberish." [Tahira Naqvi]. "Because of this, his legs were permanently swollen, something that did not appear to bother him. Recently, he had started to listen carefully to discussions about the forthcoming exchange of Indian and Pakistani lunatics. When asked his opinion, he observed solemnly: 'Uperthegurgur the annexe the baydhayana the mung the dal of the Government of Pakistan.'" [Khushwant Singh]. Both translations of Tahira and Singh respectively did not fulfill completely the requirement of meaningfulness. Singh omitted the word

"ankles" and the translation of "someone asked him" was ignored by Tahira. Collectively, Tahira's translation is better than Singh. "Because he constantly remained standing, his feet swelled up. His ankles were swollen too. But despite this bodily discomfort, he didn't lie down and rest. When in the insane asylum there was talk about Hindustan-Pakistan and the exchange of lunatics, he listened attentively. If someone asked him what his opinion was, he answered with great seriousness, "Upar di gur gur di annex di be dhyana di mung di daal of the Pakistan Government.'" [Pritchett]. "His feet were swollen with constant standing and his calves had puffed out in the middle, but in spite of this agony he never cared to lie down. He listened with rapt attention to all discussions about the exchange of lunatics between India and Pakistan. If someone asked his views on the subject he would reply in a grave tone: "Uper the gur gur the annexe the bay dhayana the mung the dal of the Government of Pakistan.'" [Anonymous]. The translation of Anonymous writer is better than Pritchett's as here, Hindustan is replaced by India and "great seriousness" is translated as "grave tone". "and was there anyone who could guarantee that both Pakistan and Hindustan would not disappear someday?" [Tahira]. "And who could say if both India and Pakistan might not entirely vanish from the map of the world one day?" [Singh]. Here, Tahira's translation led to Singh's translation. "And who could place his hand on his breast and say whether Hindustan and Pakistan might not both someday vanish entirely?" [Pritchett]. And who could say if both India and Pakistan might not entirely disappear from the face of the earth one day?"

[Anonymous]. `` and was there anyone who could guarantee...`` is the best translation of the first part of the source language rendered by Tahira naqvi. ``The guards only knew that he was from Toba Tek Singh, where he owned land. He had been a well-to-do landowner. Then, without warning, he had gone insane. His relatives had bound him with iron chains, brought him to the asylum, and admitted him.`` [Tahira]. ``Older attendants at the asylum said that he was a fairly prosperous landlord from Toba Tek Singh, who had quite suddenly gone mad. His family had brought him in, bound and fettered. That was fifteen years ago.`` [Singh]. The sentence: ``that was fifteen years ago`` is added by Khushwant Singh. `` The longtime custodians in the insane asylum knew only this much about him: that he had some lands in Toba Tek Singh. He was a prosperous landlord, when suddenly his mind gave way. His relatives bound him in heavy iron chains, brought him to the insane asylum, got him admitted, and left.`` [Pritchett]. Here ``some land`` is a wrong translation rendered by Pritchett. `` The older employees of the asylum knew that he had been a well-to-do fellow who had owned considerable land in Toba Tek Singh. Then he had suddenly gone mad. His family had brought him to the asylum in chains and left him there. They came to meet him once a month but ever since the communal riots had begun, his relatives had stopped visiting him.`` [Anonymous]. In this translation, ``well-to-do fellow`` and ``but ever since the communal riots had begun`` fulfilled the requirements of interpretation. ``He had a daughter who was grown up now. As a child, she cried whenever she saw her father, and she continued to cry for him when she was a young woman.`` [Tahira]. ``When he was first confined, he had left an infant

daughter behind, now a pretty young girl of fifteen. She would come occasionally, and sit in front of him with tears rolling down her cheeks. In the strange world that he inhabited, hers was just another face.`` [Singh]. Both translations of Tahira and Singh are incomplete. Some words are omitted and some extra words are added. `` He had one daughter who, growing a finger-width taller every month, in fifteen years had become a young girl. Bishan Singh didn't even recognize her. When she was a child, she wept when she saw her father; when she'd grown up, tears still flowed from her eyes.`` [Pritchett]. `` When he had been brought to the asylum, he had left behind an infant daughter. She was now a comely and striking young girl of fifteen, who Bishan Singh failed to recognize. She would come to visit him, and not be able to hold back her tears.`` [Anonymous]. The translation of pritchett can be considered the best one and the Anonymous translator misinterpreted the whole sentence. ``He probably wanted to say that if the man had been a Sikh god instead of a Muslim god, he might have helped Bishan Singh.`` [Tahira]. What he wanted to say was: 'You don't answer my prayers because you are a Muslim God. Had you been a Sikh God, you would have been more of a sport.`` [Singh]. Tahira translated the passage indirectly and did not expressed the intention of the writer. She used word ``god`` insted of ``God`` that is wrong because Muslims believe only in God. `` What he wanted to say was: "You don't answer my prayers because you a Muslim God. Had you been a Sikh God, you would have surely helped me out."`` [Anonymous]. `` Perhaps the meaning of this was, "You're the God of the Muslims! If you were the God of the Sikhs, you'd surely have listened to me!"`` [Pritchett]. The phrase

“ what he wanted to say was” is misinterpretation of the source language. “ Perhaps” and “probably” are meaningful words in this context.

“What can I say, except that you should remember me to bhai Balbir Singh, bhai Vadhawa Singh and bahain Amrit Kaur. Tell bhai Bibir Singh that Fazal Din is well by the grace of God. The two brown buffaloes he left behind are well too. Both of them gave birth to calves, but, unfortunately, one of them died after six days. Say I think of them often and to write to me if there is anything I can do.’ Toba Tek Sing. Then he added: ‘Here, I brought you some rice from home.’” [Singh]. Here, Khushwant Singh used the Urdu words “Bahi” and “bahain” that mean brother and sister respectively in Urdu. These are unfamiliar words for English readers that cannot convey the complete meaning. “Maronda” is a special Pakistani sweet which is translated by Singh as “rice”. It is a wrong alternative word for it. “Give my regards to Bhai Baleer Singh and Bhai Vadhwa Singh...and sister Amrit Kaur. Tell Bhai Baleer I am all right. One of the two cows he left behind has calved, had two calves...One died six days after the birth...And if there’s anything more I can do, tell them I am ready anytime. And here, I brought you some sweets.” [Tahira]. Tahira also used the Urdu word “Bhai” but she translated “bahain” as sister that is good practice. The phrase “give my regards” is better than the phrase “remember me to”. “ Give my greetings to brother Balbesar Singh and brother Vadhava Singh... And sister Amrit Kaur too.... Tell brother Balbesar that those brown water buffaloes that he left behind, one of them had a male calf.... The other had a female calf, but when it was six days old it died.... And... and if there's anything I can do for you, tell me;

I'm at your service.... And I've brought you a little puffed-rice candy.” [Pritchett]. Pritchett translated the Urdu words “bhai” and behain” as brother and sister but he also found “puffed-rice candy” as an alternative for “Maronda” and this alternative is unequal to “maronda”. “ Your family wanted me to make sure you were well. Soon you'll be moving to India. Please give my salaam to bhai Balbir Singh and bhai Raghbir Singh and bahain Amrit Kaur. Tell Balbir that Fazal Din is well. The two brown buffaloes he left behind are well too. Both of them gave birth to calves, but, unfortunately, one of them died. Say I think of them often and to write to me if there is anything I can do.” Then he added “Here, I've brought some plums for you.” [Anonymous]. It is not a real translation. “Salaam” is an Urdu word that is meaningless for English readers. The Anonymous translator used “plums” for “maronday” that is his/her mistake.

“Getting the lunatics out of the lorries and handing them over to the Indian officials proved to be an arduous task. Many of them refused to leave the lorries, and those who did ran about wildly, making it difficult for the guards and other officials to keep them under control; those who were naked tore off any clothing that was forced on them, many swore and cursed, one or two sang, some fought with each other, and others cried or wailed. Confusion was rampant. The women were also a problem, and the cold weather made everyone’s teeth chatter.” [Tahira]. “It was quite a job getting the men out of the bus handing them over to officials. Some just refused too. Those who were persuaded to do so began to run up in every direction. Some were stark naked. All effort them to cover themselves had failed because they would be kept from tearing off their garments.

Some were using abuse or singing. Others were weeping bitter fights broke out. In short, complete confusion prevailed. Female were also being exchanged and there was even a bitterly cold." [Singh]. Again Tahira leads Khushwant Singh. The sentence "Female were also being exchanged" could not find in source language. The sentence "The women were also a problem" also a wrong translation. "To extricate the lunatics from the lorries, and confide them to the care of the other wardens, was a very difficult task. Some refused to emerge at all. Those who were willing to come out became difficult to manage, because they suddenly ran here and there. If clothes were put on the naked ones, they tore them off their bodies and flung them away. Someone was babbling abuse, someone was singing. They were fighting among themselves, weeping, muttering. People couldn't make themselves heard at all-- and the female lunatics' noise and clamor was something else. And the cold was so fierce that everybody's teeth were chattering." [Pritchett]. Pritchett's translation is a meaning-based translation and his proposition: "and the female lunatics' noise and clamor was something else." is word for word but near to source language translation. "Getting the lunatics out of the trucks and handing them over to the opposite side proved to be a tough job. Some refused to get down from the trucks. Those who could be persuaded to do so began to run in all directions. Some were stark naked. As soon as they were dressed they tore off their clothes again. They swore, they sang, they fought with each other. Others wept. Female lunatics, who were also being exchanged, were even noisier. It was pure bedlam. Their teeth chattered in the bitter cold." [Anonymous]. The Anonymous translator used the "truck"

for "lorry" that is not matchable word. His translation: "they swore" is instead of "they abuse" is far from the Urdu writer's intention. "The cold weather made everyone's teeth chatter" [Tahira Naqvi] is a beautiful translation of Urdu idiom than "there was even a bitterly cold" [Singh]. But the best translation for this idiom is rendered by Pritchett as "and the cold was so fierce that everybody's teeth were chattering." "On hearing this, Bishan Singh leaped back and ran towards the remaining group of men who awaited their turn. The Pakistani soldiers caught him and tried to force him back to the checkpoint. He resisted vigorously." [Tahira]. "Bishan Singh tried to run, but was overpowered by the Pakistani guards who tried to push him across the dividing line towards India. However, he wouldn't move." [Khushwant Singh]. "On hearing this Bishan Singh leaped up, dodged to one side, and ran to rejoin his remaining companions. The Pakistani guards seized him and began to pull him in the other direction, but he refused to move." [Pritchett]. "Hearing that Bishan Singh turned and ran back to join his companions. The Pakistani guards caught hold of him and tried to push him across the line to India. Bishan Singh wouldn't move." [Anonymous]. Here, the translation of Khushwant Singh failed to convey the meaning-based message. Many phrases are translated differently by Khushwant Singh. Tahira's translation also did not fulfill this criterion. The phrases "force him back to the checkpoint" [Tahira Naqvi], "push him across the dividing line towards India" [Khushwant Singh], "pull him in the other direction" [Pritchett] lead an English reader to some extra but irrelevant information that is not available in source language. Again, the Anonymous

translator created an equivalency between source and target languages. He/she translated the same message as: ``push him across the line to India``.

Conclusion

The selected words and passages of Manto's fiction were analysed and the relationship between SL (Urdu) and TL (English) was judged carefully. The four translators of the same fiction were compared on the basis of their works. It was found that no one was capable to change the form of language but keep the meaning constant. There were some shortcomings in every translation such as omission and addition of words/phrases. Sometimes, a translation led to misinterpretation too. It was because the meaning of the source language was changed. In Brahma's point of view (2010), during the project of translation when the source language and the target language are extremely different in structure and in cultural scenario, there cannot be a real equivalent of the source language into the target language. The

translation founded on equivalency will usually always result in the loss or gain of information between the two languages (p. 2). In present case, this extreme difference and cultural gap between Urdu and English resulted in loss and/or gain of information and the four translator did not take measures in accordance with Larson's meaning-based theory. In Larson's point of view, the purpose of translation is to transfer the meaning of a source language text into a target language text. This is performed by replacing the form of the source language with the form of the target language while the meaning itself is maintained in original sense (1984, p. 12).

In spite of it all, the four translations have many literary qualities and an English reader can infer a sense of originality from their text. The aspect of domestication is apparent in these translations. By comparing their texts, the Anonymous translator can be awarded with the title of ``the best translator``.

References

- Ahmad, Khaled. (2013). *Saadat Hasan Manto - The literary renegade*. In The India Express. Retrieved from <http://www.sacw.net/article6320.html>
- Ali, Tariq. (2012). *Remembering Saadat Hasan Manto (1912-1955)*. Retrieved on 26th May, 2014 from <http://www.sacw.net/article2505.html>
- Anonymous. (1998). Toba Tek Singh (trans.). Retrieved from C:\Documents and Settings\Polo\Meus documentos\Toba Tek Singh-2.mht
- Bose, Sumantra. (2002). *Bosnia After Dayton: Nationalist Partition and International Intervention*. New York, NY: Oxford University Press.
- Brahma, A.A Gede Raka Wahyu. (2010). *The Translation of Adjective Complementation in Terra Featuring 45 Austronesia Authors in Bilingual Anthology Wordstorm, The NT Writers estival by Kadek Khrisna Adhidarma* (Unpublished Master's Thesis.). Indonésia, Denpasar: Udayana University.
- Gatt, Dashrath. (December, 2013). Feministic Concerns through Fleishy Designs: A Revisit to Saadat Hasan Manto's Short Stories. *The Criterion: An International Journal in English*, 4, vi, 60-68. ISSN 0976-8165, Retrieved from <http://www.the-criterion.com/V4/n6/Gatt.pdf>

- Jalal, Ayesha. (n. d.). *The Pity of Partition: Manto's Life, Times, and Work across the India-Pakistan Divide*. India: Harper Collins.
- Koves, Margit. (August, 1997). Telling Stories of Partition and War: Saadat Hasan Manto and Istvan Orkeny. *Economic and Political Weekly*, 2147-2158. Retrieved from http://www.epw.in/system/files/pdf/1997_32/33-34/special_articles_telling_stories_of_partition_and_war.pdf
- Larson, Meldred. (1984). *Meaning-based translation: a guide to cross-language equivalence*. Retrieved from http://docencia.udea.edu.co/TeoriaTraduccion/linguistico/mildred01_ingles.htm
- Manto, Saadat Hassan. (n. d.). Toba Tek Singh (Urdu.). Retrieved from C:\Documents and Settings\Polo\Meus documentos\Toba Tek Singh Urdu_Com.mht
- Pretchitt, F. W. (n. d.). *Toba Tek Singh* (trans.). Retrieved from C:\Documents and Settings\Polo\Meus documentos\toba-teksingh-3.mht
- Singh, Khushwant. (n. d.). *Land of Five Rivers: Selected Stories by Khushwant Singh*. Delhi, India: Orient. Retrieved from C:\Documents and Settings\Polo\Meus documentos\Toba Tek Singh by Saadat Hasan Monto-4-actual.mht
- Tahira Naqvi. (2007). Toba Tek Singh (trans.). *Manoa*, 19, 1, pp. 14-19.
- Tiwari, Sudha. (June, 2013). Memories of Partition: Revisiting Saadat Hasan Manto. *Economic & Political Weekly*, XLVIII, 25, 50-58. Retrieved from http://www.epw.in/system/files/pdf/2013_48/25/Memories_of_Partition.pdf?ip_logi_n_no_cache=925e8d58e2295f982601136362153c11
- Vanilla. (2010). *Kinds of Translation*. Retrieved from <http://transvanilla.blogspot.com.br/2010/04/kinds-of-translation.html>